



Karen B. Salmon, Ph.D.
State Superintendent of Schools

TO: Members of the State Board of Education

FROM: Karen B. Salmon, Ph.D.

DATE: July 28, 2020

SUBJECT: COMAR 13A.04.08
Programs for Social Studies
ADOPTION

PURPOSE:

The purpose of this item is to request that the State Board adopt amendments to the Code of Maryland Regulation (COMAR) 13A.04.08 *Programs for Social Studies*.

REGULATION PROMULGATION PROCESS:

Under Maryland law, a state agency, such as the State Board, may propose a new or amended regulation whenever the circumstances arise to do so. After the State Board votes to propose such a regulation, the proposed regulation is sent to the Administrative, Executive, and Legislative Review Committee (AELR) for a 15-day review period. If the AELR Committee does not hold up the proposed regulation for further review, it is published in the Maryland Register for a 30-day public comment period. At the end of the comment period, the Maryland State Department of Education (MSDE) staff reviews and summarizes the public comments. Thereafter, the MSDE staff will present a recommendation to the State Board of Education to either: (1) adopt the regulation in the form it was proposed; (2) revise the regulation and adopt it as final because the suggested revision is not a substantive change; or (3) revise the regulation and re-propose it because the suggested revision is a substantive change. At any time during the process, the AELR Committee may stop the promulgation process and hold a hearing. Thereafter, it may recommend to the Governor that the regulation not be adopted as a final regulation or the AELR Committee may release the regulation for final adoption.

BACKGROUND/HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE:

The social studies standards in Maryland were last reviewed and revised in 2015. At that time, Social Studies Standard 6.0 Skills and Processes underwent the most significant change. At the December 4, 2017, State Board of Education meeting, a request was made to review the state standards in social studies. Following the Board procedures enumerated in the May 23, 2017, Protocol for Developing and Revising Standards, the MSDE initiated a public survey from June 1, 2018, through July 1, 2018 to seek feedback on the current standards. In December 2018 the Standards Review Committee consisting of teachers, district social studies specialists, university scholars, and associated social studies organizations met to review data from the survey and to make recommendations. The panel

consisted of 26 teachers, curriculum coordinators/specialists, and stakeholders from social studies related organizations. The review panel's objective was to use their expertise, data from the public survey, and the report generated by the civic symposium held by the MSDE on June 12, 2018, to determine if edits to the standards were needed. The committee recommended that minor revisions should be made to the existing social studies standards to update academic language in social studies and to be more descriptive of the content embedded in the standards. Based on these recommendations, on May 21, 2019, the State Board granted permission for the MSDE to revise COMAR 13A.04.08 *Program for Social Studies*. After completing the revisions, feedback was sought in regional meetings and from local school social studies supervisors. On March 24, 2020, the State Board granted permission to publish the proposed amendments to COMAR 13A.03.04.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

The proposed revisions to Maryland's Social Studies Standards are the byproduct of consultation with the public, teachers, content supervisors, and nonprofit social studies advocacy organizations. The standards were published in the Maryland Register from May 22, 2020 until June 22, 2020. Three comments were provided by the public (See Attachment II). The comments expressed concern for the language in Standard 2.0 Peoples and Nations of the World, indicating that having students "inquire about the people of the United States and the world using a historically grounded, multidisciplinary approach in order to recognize multiple narratives and acknowledge the diversity and commonality of the human experience" fails to address the racism and historic systems of oppression that continue to plague our nation today.

Standard 2.0: Peoples of the Nation and the World links content learned in Prekindergarten through high school. The underlying beliefs and content associated with 2.0 are central to the study of social studies. As such, they are interwoven throughout all the content students' study in social studies. The standard allows students to connect the topics taught in United States History, World History, government, geography and World cultures courses and not just content unique to the history of the United States. In Maryland, State Frameworks further clarify how local school systems can develop curriculum, select materials of instruction, and align professional development to implement the standards. Beginning in 2015, revisions were made to the State Frameworks for Elementary Social Studies Prekindergarten through Grade 5, middle school United States History, and the high school required courses in Modern World History, American Government, and United States History. Revisions made to the State Frameworks in Social Studies (See Attachment III) address the concerns raised in these comments, therefore MSDE does not recommend changes to the proposed regulations.

ACTION:

Request that the State Board adopt amendments to COMAR 13A.04.08 *Program for Social Studies*.

ATTACHMENTS:

COMAR 13A.04.08 *Program for Social Studies*

Public Comment Summary for COMAR 13A.04.08 *Program for Social Studies*

Social Studies Frameworks, PreK-High School <http://marylandpublicschools.org/about/pages/dcaa/social-studies/msss.aspx>

State Social Studies Standards



State Board Meeting

July 28, 2020

Social Studies Standards: COMAR 13A.04.08

The comprehensive instructional program shall include:

1. Civics
2. Peoples and Nations of the World
3. Geography
4. Economics
5. History
6. Skills and Processes

Review/Revision Timeline

Event	Date
State Board of Education called for a review of the social studies standards	January 2018
Public survey conducted	July 2018
Stakeholder review of standards	December 2018
State Board of Education granted permission to revise social studies standards	May 2019
Workgroup revised standards	May-June 2019
Regional reviews conducted	July 2019 – September 2019
Revisions finalized by MSDE staff	December 2019
Revisions reviewed by Local School System Social Studies Supervisors	February 2020
State Board of Education granted permission for revised standards to be put out for public comment	March 2020
Revisions open for public comment	May 22, 2020-June 22, 2020

Public Comment

- 3 comments
- 1 comment raised concerns about ensuring that Maryland History and local history were taught
- 2 of 3 expressed concerns about the wording regarding Standard 2.0 Peoples of the Nation and the World

These concerns are addressed within the state frameworks provided to the Board.

Social Studies Frameworks

Unit 2: World War One, Prosperity and Depression, World War Two (1915-1945)

Unit Enduring Understanding: Prosperity and conflict challenge accepted principles and practices.

Unit Question: How did progress and setbacks in foreign and domestic affairs shape the development of the modern United States, its people, and its role on the international stage?

Content Topic	Essential Question	Indicator and Objectives
The 1920s	Did the 1920s preserve the past or invent the future?	<p>Students will analyze shifting cultural norms associated with rapid economic growth by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Explaining how economic policy supported innovations in science and industry and transformed production and consumption. Evaluating the progress and setbacks of the changing social and economic role of women. Assessing the impact of the Harlem Renaissance, the Great Migration, and Garveyism on the African American freedom movement. Analyzing how communities of color and immigrants resisted discrimination and racist policies through the formation of the League of United Latin American Citizens, decisions in <i>Ozawa v. U.S.</i> (1922), <i>Thind v. U.S.</i> (1923), and passage of the 1924 Indian Citizenship Act. Assessing how the Immigration Act of 1924, the Ku Klux Klan, Tulsa Race Riot, Alien Land Laws, and Eugenics perpetuated racism and discrimination against racial, ethnic, and religious minorities, those with disabilities, and LGBTQ+. Evaluating the effectiveness of Prohibition. Assessing the tension between fundamentalism and changing social values.
The Great Depression and New Deal	Was the New Deal a good deal for all Americans?	<p>Students will evaluate the impact of the Great Depression on the nation by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Understanding the causes of the crash of 1929 and the Great Depression. Analyzing the impact of the Great Depression and the Dust Bowl on farmers, businesses, workers, Mexican immigrants, and other racial and ethnic minorities. Measuring the effect of New Deal programs on the national economy, labor unions, federalism, laissez-faire economics, the development of the social safety net, and their uneven impact on racial and ethnic minorities. Evaluating the short term and long-term legacy of the New Deal.

Examples from the High School United States History Framework

- Formation and work of the NAACP
- Great Migration, Harlem Renaissance, Garveyism
- Tulsa Race Riot of 1921
- New Deal's uneven impact on racial and ethnic minorities
- Residential segregation via redlining and federal loan policies
- School desegregation and state resistance
- Efforts to address unequal access to public accommodations, economic opportunity, and political participation.
- Affirmative Action programs
- Origins and impact of the “War on Drugs” on policing and mass incarceration.

Social Studies Standards

MSDE requests permission to adopt
COMAR 13 A.04.08 *Program in Social
Studies.*

Title 13A
STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
Subtitle 04 SPECIFIC SUBJECTS

13A.04.08 Program in Social Studies

.01 Requirements for Social Studies Instructional Programs for Grades Prekindergarten — 12.

A.—B. (text unchanged)

[C. Social Studies Processes and Skills. Students shall use reading, writing, and thinking processes and skills to gain knowledge and understanding of political, historical, and current events using the following disciplinary and inquiry literacies:

(1) Disciplinary Literacies include using deliberative process, participating in school settings, following rules, making economic decisions, using economic data, identifying prices in a market, reasoning spatially, constructing maps, using geographic data, classifying historical sources, determining the purpose of an historical source, analyzing cause and effect in history; and

(2) Inquiry Literacies include questioning, selecting sources, gathering information from sources, making claims, using evidence, constructing arguments and explanations, adapting arguments and explanations, presenting arguments and explanations, critiquing arguments and explanations, analyzing social problems, assessing options for action, and taking informed action.

D. History. Students shall:

(1) Evaluate why and how events occurred;

(2) Locate and assess a variety of sources;

(3) Engage in historical inquiry involving acquiring knowledge about significant events, developments, individuals, groups, documents, places, and ideas to support investigations about the past and its connection to the present; and

(4) Analyze how individuals and societies have changed over time in Maryland, the United States, and the world.

E. Geography. Students shall:

(1) Appreciate their own place in the world and foster curiosity about environments and cultures;

(2) Use geographic reasoning associated with physical and human factors, locations of places and regions, historic changes in political boundaries, economic activities, and cultures;

(3) Use spatial and environmental perspective; and

(4) Apply geographic representation including maps, imagery, and geospatial technologies.

F. Economics. Students shall:

(1) Evaluate decision making of individuals, businesses, governments, and societies to allocate resources;

(2) Consider costs benefits and the interaction of buyers and sellers in a global market; and

(3) Develop economic reasoning to understand the historical development and current status of economic principles, institutions, and processes needed to be effective citizens, consumers, and workers participating in local communities, the nation, and the world.

G. Civics. Students shall:

(1) Understand the historical development and current status of the fundamental concepts and processes of government including authority, power, and influence, with particular emphasis on the democratic skills and attitudes necessary to become responsible citizens; and

(2) Engage in political participation and contribute to the public process.

H. Peoples of the Nation and the World. Students shall understand the diversity and commonality, human interdependence, and global cooperation of the people of the United States and the world through a multicultural and a historical perspective.]

C. Social Studies Processes and Skills. Students shall inquire about civics, geography, economics, history, and people and nations of the world using disciplinary literacy skills and processes to critically evaluate content through a variety of source materials across disciplines and use reading, writing, and other forms of communication to develop, defend, and critique arguments in order to take informed action.

D. Civics. Students shall inquire about the historical development of the fundamental concepts and processes of authority, power, and influence with particular emphasis on civic reasoning in order to become informed, responsible citizens, engage in the political process, and contribute to society.

E. Peoples of the Nation and the World. Students shall inquire about the people of the United States and the world using a historically grounded, multidisciplinary approach in order to recognize multiple narratives and acknowledge the diversity and commonality of the human experience.

F. Geography. Students shall inquire about the role of culture, technology, and the environment in the location, distribution, and impact of human activities using geographic tools and spatial thinking in order to demonstrate a significance of place.

G. Economics. Students shall inquire about decisions made by individuals and groups using economic reasoning in order to understand the historical development and current status of economic principles, institutions, and processes needed to be effective citizens, consumers, and workers participating in local communities, the nation, and the world.

H. History. Students shall inquire about significant events, ideas, beliefs, and themes to identify patterns and trends and to analyze how individuals and societies have changed over time to make connections to the present in their communities, Maryland, the United States, and the world.

I. —J. (text unchanged)

KAREN B. SALMON, Ph.D.
State Superintendent of Schools

Public Comment Summary

13A.04.08 Programs for Social Studies

Individual/Organization	Comment	MSDE Response
<p>Suzanne Benson Parkville, MD</p>	<p>I support the proposed changes to Maryland's social studies standards with the exception of the section relating to "Peoples of the Nation and the World". Specifically, I believe this section must include explicit language that addresses instruction in understanding systems of racism. To say our schools will simply "acknowledge diversity" does not go far enough in educating Maryland's children in critically analyzing our country's past and helping them to become leaders for a better tomorrow.</p>	<p>Standard 2.0: Peoples of the Nation and the World links content learned in Prekindergarten through high school. The standard allows students to connect the topics taught in United States History, World History, government, geography and World cultures courses and not just content unique to the history of the United States. In Maryland, State Frameworks further clarify how local school systems can develop curriculum, select materials of instruction, and align professional development to implement the standards. Beginning in 2015, revisions were made to the State Frameworks for Elementary Social Studies Prekindergarten through Grade 5, middle school United States History, and the high school required courses in Modern World History, American Government, and United States History. Revisions made to the State Frameworks in Social Studies address the concerns raised in this comment.</p>
<p>Alessa Giampaolo Keener, M.Ed. Reisterstown, MD</p>	<p>Please accept this email as my public comment regarding the proposed changes to COMAR 13A.04.08 social studies standards.</p> <p>Specifically, I am writing to express my concern with the language used in Section E. Peoples of the Nation and the World. Current proposed wording falls immensely short of addressing the instructional and learning needs necessary for creating a statewide standard that uniformly rejects racism within our social studies curriculum. To simply "<i>recognize multiple narratives and acknowledge the diversity and commonality of the human experience</i>" does nothing to ensure Maryland's children receive explicit instruction in and the opportunity to critically analyze the systems of oppression and racism that plague our country and world today.</p> <p>I call on the Maryland State Board of Education to NOT enact the proposed social studies regulations at this point in time. Instead, I call on the Board to re-examine the overly broad and shockingly weak language and determine appropriate substitutions that include explicit anti-racist language in our social studies content standards. Changes could include language such as: Students will identify racial inequalities and systems of oppression AND Students will examine lived differences based upon racial and ethnic lines.</p>	<p>Standard 2.0: Peoples of the Nation and the World links content learned in Prekindergarten through high school. The standard allows students to connect the topics taught in United States History, World History, government, geography and World cultures courses and not just content unique to the history of the United States. In Maryland, State Frameworks further clarify how local school systems can develop curriculum, select materials of instruction, and align professional development to implement the standards. Beginning in 2015, revisions were made to the State Frameworks for Elementary Social Studies Prekindergarten through Grade 5, middle school United States History, and the high school required courses in Modern World History, American Government, and United States History. Revisions made to the State Frameworks in Social Studies address the concerns raised in this comment.</p>

Public Comment Summary

13A.04.08 Programs for Social Studies

Individual/Organization	Comment	MSDE Response
Lisa M. visions4youth@gmail.com	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. About Maryland and local communities students live in2. History of Maryland and those that contributed to building some of the original infrastructure3. Teach kids how taxes are spent in their city4. International component of another culture to compare how other societies operate (more advanced vs less).	The specific content requests made in this comment are addressed in the State Frameworks for Social Studies in Prekindergarten through grade 5, and again in the high school American Government and Modern World History frameworks.